

A Breakthrough in Preventing Circulation of Counterfeit Goods: Adopting Technology in e-Commerce

Purwanto, Purwanto

WR. Supratman University, Surabaya, Indonesia

Email: cakpo3r@gmail.com

Abstract- *This study aims to examine the role of religion and Technology in campaigning the prevention of the sale of counterfeit goods via online. Technology design paradigm in marketing empirically contribute to the restoration of the environment of e-commerce in preventing the circulation of counterfeit goods. Web design combined with religious propaganda and ethics that representing the concept of global e-commerce design is increasingly widespread. By using attention restoration theory, this research connects Technology design with the crime of buying counterfeit goods; that is, making consumers aware of avoiding buying counterfeit goods. A series of experiments show the consistency of Technology design by exploring consumer responses to religious elements depending on the purpose of their shopping trip (browsing vs. deliberate order) and whether they pay full price or discount.*

Keywords- *Technology, Attention restoration theory, counterfeit, environmental e-Commerce.*

1. INTRODUCTION

Many counterfeit goods are distributed through online sales channels. One of the great e-commerce that lots of distributing counterfeit goods is Alibaba, so that the American union never enter the company of Alibaba in the list of counterfeit goods watch list (Corben, 2017[23]). Then Alibaba finally taking measures to combat counterfeiting by creating a system of digital ledger, which is designed to track the status of goods through the chain of supply. Next Amazon, also makes the program registry brand serves to prevent the circulation of counterfeit products in a time of less than 8 hours. So tight restrictions of the circulation of counterfeit goods through online sites such as e-Bay, Alibaba and Amazon, then consumers, today tends to start turning to other networking sites like facebook, Instagram, Snapchat (Thaichon & Quah, 2016[78]; Lissitsa & Kol, 2016[45]), because the regulatory framework for this channel, is still low. According to Google & Temasek (2017[29]), purchases of products via e-commerce in Indonesia reached US \$10.9 billion or around IDR 146.7 trillion, and losses to the national economy reached IDR 65.1 trillion. Transfer of the way to buy counterfeit goods from e-bay, Alibaba and Amazon sites to other e-shopping sites because this site is increasingly interactive, making it easier for millennial consumers as sales targets (Park et al., 2015[60]; Wang et al., 2015[84]; Pantano & Priporas, 2016[59]; Yoo et al., 2010[86]). Dexacorn e-Commerce in Indonesia, such as bli-bli.com, Lazada, Tokopedia, Bukalapak are allegedly becoming new channels that are very easy for consumers to buy counterfeit

products. Therefore, the circulation of the product through this new channel, can be seen as a problem that is significant for emerging market and describes the death, the destruction of the economy (Brown et al., 2012[15]). Model of countermeasures that are appropriate, need to understand the phenomenon of counterfeiting as a whole. A lot of previous research reviewed on various motives of consumers involved in the purchase of counterfeit goods on online platforms (see, Thaichon & Quah, 2016[78]; Bian et al., 2015[9]; Stöttinger & Penz, 2015[75]; Nwankwo et al., 2014[58]; Tang et al., 2014[77]; Bian & Moutinho, 2011[9]). But those studies are failed, captures the effect of the nature of online sites that become more interactive, with facilities of controlability, synchronicity, and bi-directionality, thus giving space to run the black market (Aron, 2014[4]; Yoo et al., 2010[86]; McMillan, 2005[48]; Fortin & Dholakia, 2005[26]; Liu, 2003[46]; Coyle & Thorson, 2001[24]). There is a possibility that controlability, synchronicity, and bi-directionality push the rate of growth of sales via online exceeds the traditional retail, but without considering the legitimacy of the goods that are traded (Clemes et al., 2014[19]; Faqih, 2016[27]; Tontini, 2016[80]; Purwanto et al., 2019[62]). Controllability manipulates content, timing, and sequence of communication (Coyle & Thorson, 2001[24]; Fortin & Dholakia, 2005[26]). Synchronicity refers to the speed of communication and response communication (Coyle & Thorson, 2001[24]; Hoffman & Novak, 1996[32]; McMillan, 2005[48]). Bretz (1983[14]) bi-directionality as two-way communication. By hence the nature of the

Journal of Research in Marketing, Volume 11 No.1 October 2019, pp. 857-867, doi:10.24018/jrm.11.1.857-867

site which is more interactive allows perpetrators of e-commerce getting more easiness to transaction in free. International attention today is only focusing on big sites and motives to buy counterfeit goods from the buyer sides (such as the price motives, quality, attributes and styles), while the nature of the seller sites (controlability, synchronicity, and bi-directionality) are neglected (Jiang & Cova, 2012[36]; Nwankwo et al., 2014[58]; Stöttinger & Penz 2015[75]; Tang et al., 2014). Interactivity on the other hand causes boredom, tends to be greedy, and individualistic (Lotz et al., 2010[47]; Brocato et al., 2015[13]). This is according to the commentators, e-commerce experiences the "discovery deficit" customers (Verde & Wharton, 2015), due to the nature of the site which is too freely is so boring and there is no experience that is unique, wild and not controlled, without ethics and rules, especially for customers who are aware will trade in counterfeit goods. Channel of e-shopping which is great and easy with little regulation tends to attract attention, but it becomes the trigger of the emergence of counterfeit goods trading crime (Bloch et al., 1993[12]; Wong et al., 2012[85]; Wong et al., 2015; Thaichon & Quah, 2016[78]). Many digital retail experts argue that e-shopping can help prevent the circulation of counterfeit goods through digital restoration by including religious and ethical elements on its website for a majority moslem country (Nejdet, 2000[52]; Riquelme et al., 2012[66]; Chen et al., 2015[18]; Groß, 2016[30]) as a person who has high level of religiosity tend to not engage in behavior that is not ethical (Andaya, 2009[2]; Coopers & Pullig, 2013[22]; Rawwas, 1994[64]). Digital restoration in e-shopping is by integrating religious and ethical elements (for example, displaying an appeal that buying counterfeit goods is forbidden in accordance to religious teachings and promoting anti-counterfeiting culture). The researcher of contemporary marketing invent the term "Technology retail design" that combines form, elements, and the value of religious into the environment of digital retail (Joye et al., 2010[34]; Tjahjono, 2014[79]). The existence of religion is very important in fortifying human civilization from evil and harmful actions (Vitell et al., 2005[82]; Casey, 2009[17]; Arli & Tjiptono, 2014[6]; Arli et al., 2016[7]). Religion that is synonymous with the teachings of the great life, can move human behavior (Idler, 2008). More advanced, Idler stated that the teaching of religion is not just an obligation to God. But also as a filter for an increasingly complex world civilization. Technology is an important agenda for moving dead joints in the trade context. Technology is based on religion, as the moral foundation while the moral of the soul is behavior and ethics. Therefore the substance of religion is building a life with good

behavior (eg, avoid transacting counterfeit goods). In the context of the environment of retail in general, the restoration of the concept of Technology as servicescape and breakthrough is helpful for the improvement of mental and realizing acts that deviate (Kellert, 2008). Extending the thought of Bitner (1992[11]), Shaw and Clarke (1999[72]) and Vitell (2009[81]) states that the design of Technology, which consists of the elements of religion and ethics that are placed in the environment of e-commerce raises emotional responses and evocative in e-shopping and consumers will aware how despicable when doing transactions of counterfeit goods. According to Kaplan (1995[39]) based on attention restorative theory (ART), that the benefits of restoration from natural elements are also beneficial for mental health. Mentally healthy can think clearly, have a certain noble and afraid of doing detrimental acts (to trade counterfeit goods). Although Kaplan's opinion refers to human health in general, researchers try to expand this thinking to consumer market behavior, by linking the nuances of consumption to the e-shopping environment with religion (Larson et al., 1986[42]; Levin, 1997[43]). Thus, their religion and ethics in the context of shopping can help lessen the trading of counterfeit goods as a result of an element of restorative in the environment of e-commerce. Previous research only focused on the influence of religion and ethics on the purchase of counterfeit goods (Levin, 1997[43]; Levin & Puchalski, 1997[44]; Chiu & Leng, 2016[20]; Phau et al., 2009[61]; Lai & Zaichowsky, 1999[41]; Arli, 2017[5]; Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]). But the influence of Technology design in the context of e-commerce on the health of the soul and consciousness of morale is still relatively not studied yet, although the format of digital retail is increasingly popular in the world (Nielsen, 2014[55]; Yan & Eckman, 2009[87]). As such, this paper has three objectives. First, it examines a new field in digital retail research that is, the restorative potential of Technology design in e-commerce environments. The findings of the research have indicated fully that for consumers shopping holic via online will get the benefits, the clarity of emotion, so it can be freed from the nature of greed and evil. Second, by using ART from Kaplan (1995;2001[39][40]), this research bridges the design of Technology and the paradigm of consumer ethics research in digital retail (Yoo et al., 2010[86]; Kamarulzaman, et al. 2016[37]; Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]) to demonstrate the design of Technology can change consumers to realize buying counterfeit goods is a despicable act. In particular, the paradigm is showing how services, such as e-shopping, can increase the awareness of moral, to not trade in

Journal of Research in Marketing, Volume 11 No.1 October 2019, pp. 857-867, doi:10.24018/jrm.11.1.857-867

counterfeit goods (Vitell, 2009[81]). Thirdly, the paper is examining the consistency of Technology design with restorative potential of elements of religion and ethics while having transaction and dealing with three typical situations: shopping online, just browsing or directly order and pay the full price or compared with discount price (Reynolds et al., 2012[65]; Alford & Biswas, 2002[1]; Rosenbaum et al., 2018[69]). This research has systematics as follows: First review the literature of restoration and framework of digital retail (Yoo et al., 2010[86]; Kamarulzaman, et al., 2016[37]; Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]) as a basis in the development of hypotheses with experimental design. Second, we analyze the impact of e-shopping web design with Technology when consumers are in a condition: just browsing versus aiming to place an order, and pay the full price versus the discounted price. Finally, it proposes theoretical and managerial implications in this study.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Technology Design in the e-commerce environment

E-commerce site design with Technology is a relatively new concept and research paradigm in digital marketing. As mentioned previously, Joye et al. (2010[34]) and Tjahjono (2014[79]) conceptualize the term "design Technology" which means the integration of elements of religion or norms/ethics into the environment of e-commerce and its benefits. Although religion in the ethics of consumption (Levin, 1997[43]; Levin & Puchalski, 1997[44]; Kamarulzaman, et al., 2016[37]; Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]) ethical consumption (Vitell, 2009[81]), interactive (Yoo, et al., 2010[86]), flexibility and interactivity (Purwanto & Kuswandi, 2017[63]) are widely used, but empirical research that tests consumer responses to Technology design in e-commerce environments is still relatively small. Technology as metaphysical therapy instills knowledge and understanding as the spirit in taking action (Zuhdi, 2011). Technology argument is religion as the spirit of morality life (the moral) in someone who serves to enhance the moral man. Religion with its teachings attempt to move live organism. In specific, animate organisms in the ecosystem of human body. While religion is a belief in the existence of a supernatural power that regulates and creates nature and its contents (Morreall & Tamara, 2013[50]; Nongbri, 2013[56]). Casey (2009[17]) explains the benefits of religion for individuals that essentially divided on two domains, namely individual and social. In the realm of individual, existence of religion can affect the existence of mental health of someone in a case of this can reduce stress. The realm

of social, where religion has a connection with the reduction of behavioral conduct that is close to the crime or behavior that is risky including doing trade of counterfeit goods (haram) via online. Idler (2008) provides an overview of the benefits of religion in two things, namely the benefits that are physical and psychological in nature. The benefits physically can be seen from the existence of religious practices that directs to healthier live and avoid behaviors that can damage the health of the body. The benefits are psychological in nature, in this case can provide tranquility and well-being that are psychologically associated with the rituals and behaviors of religious. Similarly, when talking about ideal conditions in one of the religious teachings, namely Islam. Islam is etymologically itself derived from the word salima which means congratulations which of the words are formed aslama which is interpreted as a surrender of self or subject and obedient (Jamal, 2011[35]). In terminological Jamal (2011) explains more that Islam is a religion of revelation which core is monotheism or oneness of God which is derived by Allah to the Prophet Muhammad as the last messenger and applies to all human being, wherever and whenever which the teachings covering all aspects of life in human being. This aspect of life in humans is related to human relations with God, humans and other nature. The existence of Islam is often aimed at the concept of mercy for all of nature (rahmatan lil'alamin) (Zuhdi, 2011). The concept of grace for all of nature is much further explained by the existence of Islam as a way of life that is total and complete both the subject matter of the world and the hereafter, which is a set of beliefs and ordinances of worship, the system of law, civilization and culture. With a look at the concept of Islam, it can be concluded that the goal of Islam itself associated with the presence of the adherents themselves are made human personally well in spiritual, physical as well as the behavior in the level of the individual and the social arrangement that are not mutually detrimental as in the context of trade, in accordance which is taught by the Messenger of Allah by giving priority to honesty.

2.2 Technology Design and Attention Restoration Theory (ART)

Specialist of social start examines the influence of the element of religion in the commercial environment that is highly interactive and flexible (Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]; Purwanto & Kuswandi, 2017[63]; Vitell 2009[81]; Arli, 2017[5]), to the behavior of consumption and the results were related with ethical behavior. For example, consumers may have innate desire to shop in online with a variety of conveniences like shopping in offline (Yoo et al.,

2010[86]) which is very flexible (Purwanto & Kuswandi, 2017[63]), to get the goods are in accordance with the order (Buttner & Göritz, 2007[16]). The findings of the study indeed show retailers can realize the social benefits of Technology design, which come from increasing e-shopping awareness, positive responses from shoppers, improving mental health, decreasing crime and violence (Larson et al., 1986[42]; Söderlund & Newman, 2015[73]). Marketing research efforts to examine the potential for crime reduction or restorative in e-commerce environments that are based on ART (Larson et al., 1986[42]; Levin, 1997[43]; Levin & Puchalski, 1997[44]; Kaplan, 1995; 2001[39][40]), and support the axioms of Technology hypotheses. Restorative is part of the scope of the psychological environment that is geared to experience psychological and/or the process of psychological healing that is triggered by the environment and the configuration specified, one of it is restorative environment. ART explained that an environment that is restorative can reduce temporary physical or mental exhaustion that is caused by saturation in the activities of everyday life are performed continuously (Kaplan, 1995[39]). Saturation is the cause of mental fatigue, or are known by the designation Directed Attentional Fatigue (DAF). Attention Restoration Theory predicts that the e-commerce environment has a relationship with DAF in creating a restorative atmosphere by having four characteristics that can facilitate the restoration of fatigue, namely being away, fascination, compatibility and flexibility/completeness to extents (Kaplan, et al., 1989[38]; Rosenbaum & Massiah, 2011[69]). An environment can be stated restorative when it has something different from its daily (being away), depends on the atmosphere of changing that want to be achieved. Desire to be free from routine obligation, live purpose, burnout or emotional thought (Kaplan, 1989[38]; Felsten, 2009[25]). Nature often become the chosen purpose to obtain restorative effect. Nature has characteristics of place that different from the daily environment. Likewise, e-commerce environment should give religious nuance that campaign morality by avoiding negative acts without transacting counterfeit goods as routinity, to achieve different environment. An environment is considered restorative if it has fascination. People tend to respond to the attractiveness of the environment as a key to self- recovery from mental fatigue (Kaplan, 1995[39]). This enchantment can be obtained if the e-commerce environment presents a religious nuance, soothes the mind, so that one becomes obedient to the principle, including not conducting counterfeit goods transactions. An environment is said to be restorative if it appears as the

part of looseness/completeness scale (scope) for exploration (extent). It aimed to physical concepts and interpretation of relation among spaces in the environment. Environment is seen as a scope that considers as a wide organizational structure, which have a wide range of devices not only the completeness of the variants of the product, space and time, but also a variety of detection device and appeal against a ban on trade of counterfeit goods. So that the e-commerce environment can be accepted by consumers to visit and spend time in it. An environment is said to be restorative if it had the suitability purpose or aim (compatibility) to every person. Many new designs at certain e-commerce environment that tend to be considered interesting. Thus environment that being offered has suitability with human needs. Conformity between people and the environment of e-commerce facilitates feelings (Morris & Chebat, 2005[49]), so that a person easily feel comfortable to act reasonably in accordance with the norms that exist in the environment (Kaplan, 1995[39]). Environment in general is said to be restorative because it contains four properties (being away, fascination, compatibility and flexibility/completeness) that can heal and liberate human beings from mental fatigue (Stack & Shultis, 2013[74]). In marketing disciplines, ethics and religious researchers (Levin, 1997[43]; Levin & Puchalski, 1997[44]; Vitell, 2009[81]; Rodriguez-Rad & Ramos-Hidalgo, 2018[67]) and service researchers (Rosenbaum & Wong, 2015[69]) provide empirical evidence that the environment that full of buildings, both commercial and non-commercial, that integrates religious elements can help change the human mind in soul recovery, so that it can free from the desire to be detrimental (see Söderlund & Newman, 2015[75]; Vitell 2009[81]). In the physical environment, for example, patients with cancer experience levels of tiredness related to cancer which is lower after spending time in the center of the source of power of cancers that contain restorative properties (Rosenbaum & Smallwood, 2013[69]). Vitell (2009[81]) concluded that consumers showed choice for shopping in the neighborhood with high religious and ethical nuance that can improve consuming ethics. While other researchers showed that shoppers assess that business which is surrounded by a guarantee of genuine goods deserves to charge prices up to 50% higher than businesses without guarantee of original goods (Terrapin, 2012).

2.3 Design of Technology and Campaign of Anti Counterfeit Goods

Research of religiosity previously not specifically analyzes the use of elements of religion, such as the principle of morality, ethics in the context of the

propaganda of anti- counterfeiting. But the format of e-commerce sites that highlight the propaganda and atmosphere of religiosity in consumption ethics is increasingly popular in Muslim countries (Arli, 2017[5]; Kamarulzaman, 2016[37]; Arli & Tjiptono, 2014[6]). E-commerce sites that tend to be interactive with facilities of controlability, synchronicity, and bi-directionality can produce e-commerce into a more interactive and flexible browsing space for consumers (Yoo et al., 2010[86]; Purwanto & Kuswandi, 2017[63]). Interactive browsing space in its turn can encourage feelings of being connected with being away, fascination, extent and compatibility, so as to promote the restoration of counterfeit goods transaction prevention in the e-commerce environment. The discussion of this shows that, in the context of e-commerce as a platform of transactions, integrating elements of religion can prevent the shopper from the intentions of evil conduct purchases of counterfeit goods. Assessment of Technology design potential on e-commerce are still not there yet, thereby we fill the void of this research to propose a hypothesis of research following:

H1. E-commerce restorative benefit that includes elements of religious (moral and ethical) perceive much lower (a) being away, (b) fascination, (c) the extent and (d) compatibility compared to consumers who trade without the element of religion.

3. RESEARCH STUDY 1



3.2 Measuring instrument

The method that is used adopts in research of environment psychology (Felsten 2009[25]; Berto, 2005[8]). Respondents were instructed to evaluate the restoration of the design of e-shopping with one item questions for each of the four sub- dimensions of ART on a scale Likert 7 point (1 = "not at all," 7 = "very agree"). Grain of questions for being the way is "e-shopping website environment makes you feel different away from the habit before. How great e-shopping websites environment makes you more calm, not eager to buy counterfeit goods? Grain of questions for the fascination is "e- shopping website environment giving

3.1 The response to religion versus unreligion

3.1.1 Participant

Respondents were drawn from private college which is located in the city of a metropolitan in East Java Indonesia. Forty - two participants (M age = 21.50 SD age = 5.85, age range: 19-28 years) were taken as respondents. Respondents obtain the value of a currency course that is taken as a reward in a study of this. The sample consisted of 54.76% men (n = 23) and 45.24% women (n = 19). Given the size of the effect is medium to large, then 30 participants per cell will generate power of approximately 80%, which is the power of the minimum recommended to research the usual (Cohen, 1988[21]).

3.1.2 Scenarios and procedures

All respondents were told to watch a 1.30 minute video that illustrates web e- shopping in Indonesia. One of the researchers explained to the respondent that a site of e-shopping will help the prevention of the circulation of counterfeit goods through the canals of this and respondents were asked to answer a questionnaire (anonymous) after watching the video. Version religion shows sites that are designed to appeal about the prevention of the circulation of counterfeit goods by design approach to morals and ethics, while the version of the non- religious sites that show in general, without features of the design that urging the prevention of circulation of counterfeit goods with the concept of morals and ethics as shown in the figure 1 below.

a feeling like you are free from the action deviated and whole heart that you can be involved in an environment where there is prevention of the circulation of counterfeit goods. Grain of questions for extents is "How great e-shopping website design is drawing attention ? Lastly, grains of question for compatibility is " How great e-shopping website design makes you feel comfortable and calm?

3.3 Results

Mechanical analysis were used with one-way multivariate analysis of variance (MANOVA) to analyze the relationship between the two types of Technology of e-shopping (religious and non-religious)

on four variables tied to the restoration of e-commerce. Results of the analysis showed differences were significant between the two types at the dependent measure (Wilks' $\Lambda = 0.77$, $F(4, 67) = 5.09$, $p < 0.01$). The multivariate η^2 based on Wilks' lambda is quite strong at 0.26. Table 1 comprise the mean and the intersection standard of measuring tools bound to both groups of religious and nonreligious e-shopping. To reduce the possibility of false-positive results or type I errors (Green & Salkind, 2014; McDonald, 2014), a bonferroni method is needed to test each ANOVA at the 0.0125 level. Results of the Analysis of variance for being way ($F(1.66) = 41.07$, $p < 0.001$, $\eta^2 = 0.24$), compatibility ($F(1, 66) = 30.11$, $p < 0.01$, $\eta^2 = 0.19$), fascination ($F(1, 66) = 29.03$, $p < 0.01$, $\eta^2 = 0.21$), and

significant. ANOVA results for extent ($F(1.66) = 8.77$, $p < 0.05$, $\eta^2 = 0.05$) are not significant, because they exceed a cutoff of 0.0125 points. In general the results of the analysis is stated that consumers who see the e-shopping using design Technology tend more to feel their restorative environment with elements being way, compatibility, fascination, compared with customers who do not see the e-shopping which do not use the design of Technology. With such, the results of the analysis support first hypothesis (H1). Therefore, the design of the restoration of the e-commerce environment with the concept Technology appear as restorative servicescapes that promotes kindness when using genuine goods (Stöttinger & Penz, 2015[75]; Vitell, 2009[81]).

Table 1
Means and standard deviations of the dependent variables for the lifestyle center.

Perceived restorative scale (1 = "not at all"; 7 = "very much")	Religy		Non religy	
	M	SD	M	SD
Being away	5.37**	1.24	4.03	1.38
Extent	4.38*	1.17	3.89	1.33
Fascination	5.39**	1.25	4.54	1.34
Compatibility	5.52**	1.03	4.43	1.46

* $p < .05$ and ** $p < .01$

3.4 Discussion

The findings reinforce and broaden the perspective of Technology design as a potential restoration of e-shopping websites environment that highlight religious and ethical elements by collaborating on ART theory. This research provides new perspective about the popularity of the pattern of living that honest and clean, namely, familiarize yourself to care to the ban of the use counterfeit goods into the culture of life. This research firmly placing the design of Technology into the paradigm of transformative service research (Anderson et al., 2013[3]) and a disciplined society (Frumkin, 2003[28]) to be empirically prove the potential of restorative elements of religion and ethics in the context of e-commerce to someone mental health (Vitell, 2009[81]). Given those exploring the e-shopping website tend to browse (Nielsen, 2016[55]; Groß, 2018[31]), which became the question is, whether people who tend to be a browser more perceive the potential restoration of e-shopping environment than people who deliberately go shopping? How consistent is the consumer's attitude toward Technology design when focused deliberately on shopping rather than just browsing? The findings of the study have confirmed the consistency of the Technology design effect on the response of consumers either the browser or intentionally shopping via online.

4. RESEARCH STUDY 2

4.1 The response to the existence of religion and ethics / no religion and ethics by deliberately buy counterfeit goods or just browsing.

Shopping or surfing on e-commerce as entertainment, sight seeing, so it can divert attention from the routine of everyday (Tauber, 1972[76]; Yoo, 2010[86]). Browsing to see goods merchandise with the purpose of searching for information, or pleasure without intent to buy (Nsairi, 2012[57]; Reynolds et al., 2012[65]). With a design that is attractive, contains a sentence invitation that soothing, usefulness tends to encourage consumers like to see it (Nedra, et al., 2018[53]). Given the benefits of restorative that is associated with nature, religion and ethics in general (Kaplan, 2001[40]; Vitell, 2009[81]), can give the effect of hearts shade and mental refreshment, then the shopper feel the effects of spiritual during and after browsing in e-shopping (Nsairi, 2012[57]). Spiritual effect is helping browsers cleanse their spiritual from negative intention, harm others, and focus back on the issues that are more useful. Thus, the findings of Nsairi can be elaborated on restoration power which contains the feelings associated with being way, fascination, compatibility and extents. Therefore, question that must be considered is whether the design of Technology on the

e-shopping sites influences differently on consumers who plan to buy or just browsing only. Although the prospective buyers via online rarely noticed information with religious nuance in e-shopping sites, but such buyers which deliberately looking for counterfeit products tend to ignore the design of religion. Therefore, those statements can generate hypotheses follows:

H2: Consumers who do browsing, tend more to feel the nuances of restorative (being the way, fascination, compatibility and extents) which includes religion and ethics than consumers who deliberately decide to buy counterfeit goods.

4.2 Methodology

Respondents who participated in study 2 is the number of 75 participants (M age = 19.56, SD age = 2.21, range age: 19-28 years) taken from private college in the metropolis city in East Java Indonesia. Respondents obtain score from a course that is taken as a reward in a study of this. The sample consisted of 53.33% men (n = 40) and 46.66% women (n = 35). Study 2, using a 2 x 2 design to test the power of restoration and the possibility of approaching facilities at two levels of Technology (religious vs. unrelated) and two levels of shopping motives (browsing vs. deliberately buying counterfeit goods). Twenty - five informants appeared in each experimental condition (N = 75). The scenario was similar to Study 1, respondents are randomly selected to view the video duration of 1.30 designs web designed by advertising propaganda ban on the sale of counterfeit products, in the laboratory are impermeable sound and free of pressure. The religious version shows elements of religion and ethics, and the non-religious version displays the same area of web design without elements of religion and ethics. Before watching the video, the group was asked to imagine entered in the e-shopping site just for browsing only, while groups of others were asked to imagine going to buy certain counterfeit goods. Study 2 tool measuring instrument that is used is the same with studies 1. That is, participants were asked to rate the restoration power of each e-shopping which is designed Technology by using one item questions for each of the four sub-

dimensions of ART (being the way, fascination, compatibility and extent), in accordance with procedures in the field of environmental psychology (Berto, 2005[8]).

4.3 Results

The influence of both the Technology design conditions and the purpose of consumers visiting the e-shopping site on the four environmental conditions of the e-shopping or the dependent variable, which promotes moral restoration (being way, fascination, compatibility and extent), can be seen from the results of MANOVA. The results are showing significant difference in the conditions of Technology design at the dependent measure (Wilks' $\Lambda = 0.84$, $F(4, 113) = 6.49$, $p < 0.001$). η^2 multivariate 0.19 showed Wilks lambda strong. While the Motive for visiting the e-shopping site and the four dependent variables there was no significant difference (Wilks' $\Lambda = 0.95$, $F(4, 113) = 1.50$, ns). The interaction between Technology design conditions and the purpose of visiting e-shopping sites is not significant. Table 2 presents the mean and deviation standard of the four variables restorative, and its relationship with the Technology design and the purpose of visiting the e-shopping site. To follow up on MANOVA on the dependent variable ANOVA testing was performed, with boferoni technique at each ANOVA at the level of 0.0125. The result of being away ($F(1, 116) = 17.70$, $p < .001$, $\eta^2 = 0.23$), fascination ($F(1, 116) = 8.71$, $p < .01$, $\eta^2 = 0.06$), compatibility ($F(1, 116) = 19.52$, $p < 0.001$, $\eta^2 = 0.16$), and extent ($F(1, 116) = 18.47$, $p < 0.001$, $\eta^2 = 0.18$) all are significant. Thus, hypothesis H2 is partially supported. In particular visitor of e-shopping site tends to feel the potential restoration that use Technology design including elements of religion and ethics than the e-shopping site which do not have the element of Technology. Furthermore, the findings is very strong regardless whether consumers often visit the e-shopping site for browsing only or intended to buy the specified goods. The findings have demonstrated that the e-shopping site with Technology design give enlightenment to the browser as well as nonbrowser awareness and recovery of mental to be more honest in the transaction.

Table 2
Means and standard deviations for browsing versus purposeful shopping

Dependent measures	Natural elements M (SD)		Natural elements M (SD)	
	Browse	Purposeful visit e-shopping	Browse	Purposeful visit e-shopping
Perceived restorative scale (1 = "not at all"; 7 = "very much")				
Being away	5.76 (.95)	5.14 (1.32)	4.71 (1.13)	4.40 (1.24)
Fascination	5.02 (1.31)	4.64 (1.55)	4.01 (1.35)	4.21 (1.25)
Compatibility	6.01 (1.04)	5.36 (1.45)	4.46 (1.84)	4.45 (1.71)

Extent	5.92 (.90)	5.39 (1.32)	4.71 (1.27)	4.64 (1.43)
--------	------------	-------------	-------------	-------------

5. CONCLUSION

Marketing researchers who care about protecting original products show that consumers respond positively to the integration of religion and ethics or Technology design, through design planner (Vitell, 2009; Söderlund & Newman, 2015), into the context of e-commerce and commercial services (Mower et al., 2012; Tifferet & Vilnai-Yavetz, 2017) and non-commercial service (Rosenbaum and Smallwood, 2013; Tjahjono, 2014; Arli et al., 2017). Research is expanding the understanding about the discipline of ethics marketing on the elements of Technology design in digital retail to examine the potential restorative in the context of the marketplace, e-shopping, shows that the Technology design could play a transformative role in the awareness of individuals and perhaps even community and society (Anderson et al., 2013; Arli, 2017). From the results of two studies of experiments showed that consumers perceive the potential restoration of the environment of e-commerce with the Technology design as a style of life that uses elements of religion and ethics in general, consumers that see the e-shopping site with Technology design more may provide awareness not to do deviate and harm of the consumers who do not see their Technology designs that is the nature of the environment that embodies restorative environment (ie, being way, fascination, compatibility and extents). Study 2 based on Study 1 shows that consumers' choices for Technology design elements are stronger regardless of whether shoppers often visit e-shopping sites for sight seeing or buy certain items. On the one hand, the specialist of retail might argue that the findings of this just shows that the consumer more like shopping without the prohibition of buying counterfeit goods with a price that is cheap (Bian et al., 2015). On the other hand, the results of this study add theoretical insight into why shoppers show a preference for Technology design elements for academics and digital retail practitioners. That is, when the element of Technology incorporated into the design of e-shopping site, shoppers can perceive the potential of restorative environment of e-commerce. By thus, they feel the new environment that can prevent or reduce a person to transact this forbidden items.

5.1 Theoretical Implications

The view that the e-shopping site which showing Technology design as a new way to prevent the circulation of counterfeit goods at least help government employers, owners of brands legitimately can be protected (Stöttinger & Penz, 2015; Chiu & Leng, 2016). That is, researchers of piracy products and

black market are finding that the effects of exposure to religion and ethics help people reduce commit fraudulent and harmful (Vitell, 2009). We encourage the researchers to better assess the transformative potential regarding the Technology design in health are service, rehabilitation of drug, and the Institute of correctional (Terrapin, 2012).

5.2 Managerial Implications

Although researchers of ethical marketing support benefits were related to the Technology design on the environment of e-commerce (Vitell 2009; Tjahjono, 2014; Tontini, 2016), as moral information but monetary profit-making remains a goal principal of the investment. With other words, although there is transformative potential to repair the moral of consumers, the element of design of religion and ethics is chosen to push more wisely consumption. Given the central style of life is designed to attract consumers who care about the rampant circulation of counterfeit goods especially in countries with the majority of Moslems, its success is still in doubt of the Technology design permanently. Therefore, we encourage researchers of ethics of marketing to examine how the environment of nonprofit companies incorporate elements of Technology design into their context. In particular, the research can investigate the extent to which Technology design with more widely elements not only prevent the circulation of counterfeit goods but also could repair the moral more spacious so that could be applied in various fields such as the institution of correctional, center of urban teens activities, centers of drug rehabilitation, rehabilitation center of health and hospitals.

5.3 Limitation

Research of Technology design in the environment of e-commerce is relatively new, the researchers only focus on assessing the response of consumers to the context of religious and unreligious consumption. Thus, we still lack of understanding about the specific types of elements of digital technology that generate consumer positive responses. That is, the types of religious propaganda and ethics in particular, forms of web design that continuously propagate the danger of buying counterfeit goods that can encourage more positive responses from consumers than others. Therefore, researchers recommend that architect of landscape and researchers of web design gives information related with the prevention of purchasing the counterfeit goods fill the void of this theory. From a methodological perspective, researchers conducted two empirical studies using students at a private college in a

city in Indonesia. However, findings about the design of e-commerce web with Technology consistent in both studies and supports the literature that there is a positive response from the consumer to the Technology design.

6. REFERENCES

- [1] Alford, B.L., & Biswas, A., (2002). The effects of discount level, price consciousness and sale proneness on consumers' price perception and behavioral intention. *Journal Business Research*, 55(9), 775–783.
- [2] Andaya, B.W. (2009). Between empires and emporia: the economics of christianization in early modern southeast Asia. *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 53(1), 357-392.
- [3] Anderson, L., Ostrom, A.L., Corus, C., Fisk, R.P., Gallan, A.S., Giraldo, M., & Shirahada, K. (2013). Transformative service research: an agenda for the future. *Journal Business. Research*. 66 (8), 1203–1210.
- [4] Aron, H., (2014) Christmas Shopper Alert! How eBay, Amazon and Alibaba Fuel the World's Top Illegal Industry the Counterfeit products Market. *LA Weekly*. (Retrieved from) (<http://www.laweekly.com/news/christmas-shopper-alert-how-ebay-amazon-and-alibaba-fuel-5261019>).
- [5] Arli, D. (2017) "Does ethics need religion? Evaluating the importance of religiosity in consumer ethics", *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 35 (2), 205-221
- [6] Arli, D. & Tjiptono, F. (2014). The end of religion? Examining the role of religiousness, materialism, and long-term orientation on consumer ethics in Indonesia. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 123 (3), 385-400.
- [7] Arli, D., Cherrier, H. and Tjiptono, F. (2016). God blesses those who wear Prada: exploring the impact of religiousness on attitudes toward luxury among the youth of Indonesia. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 34(1),61-79.
- [8] Berto, R., (2005). Exposure to restorative environments helps restore attentional capacity. *Journal Environmen. Psychology*, 25(3), 249–259.
- [9] Bian, X., Haque, S., & Smith, A. (2015). Social power, product conspicuousness, and the demand for luxury brand counterfeit products. *Journal Social Psychology*, 54, 37–54.
- [10] Bian, X. & Moutinho, L. (2011). The role of brand image, product involvement, and knowledge in explaining consumer purchase behaviour of counterfeits. *European Journal of Marketing*, 45(1/2), 191-216.
- [11] Bitner, M.J. (1992). Servicescapes: the impact of physical surroundings on customers and employees. *Journal Marketing*, 56(2), 57–71.
- [12] Bloch, P.H., Bush, R.F., & Campbell, L. (1993). Consumer “accomplices” in product counterfeiting: a demand side investigation. *Journal. Consum. Mark.* 10 (4), 27–36.
- [13] Brocato, D.E., Baker, J., & Voorhees, C.M. (2015). Creating consumer attachment to retail service firms through sense of place. *Journal Academic Marketing Science*, 43(1),200–220.
- [14] Bretz, R. (1983). *Media for Interactive Communication*. Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.
- [15] Brown, S., McDonagh, P., & Shultz, C. (2012). Dark marketing: ghost in the machine or skeleton in the cupboard?. *Euro Business Review*, 24(3), 196–215.
- [16] Büttner, O.B., & Göritz, A.S. (2007). Perceived Trustworthiness of Online Shops. *ournal of Consumer Behaviour*, Copyright © 2007 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- [17] Casey, P. (2009). The psycho-social benefits of religion practise. Retrieve from: http://www.ionainstitute.ie/pdfs/Religious_practice.pdf anggal (June 16th 2016)
- [18] Chen, J., Teng, L., Liu, S., & Zhu, H. (2015). Anticipating regret and consumers' preferences for counterfeit luxury products. *Journal of Business Research*, 68, 507–515.
- [19] Clemes, M.D., Gan, C., & Zhang, J. (2014). An empirical analysis of online shopping adoption in Beijing, China. *Journal Retailing Consumer Services*, 21(3), 364–375.
- [20] Chiu, W., & Leng, H. K. (2016). Consumers intention to purchase counterfeit sporting goods in Singapore and Taiwan. *Asia Pacific Journal Marketing Logistic*, 28(1), 23–36.
- [21] Cohen, J., (1988). *Statistical Power Analysis for the Behavioral Sciences*, Second ed. Erlbaum, New Jersey.
- [22] Cooper, M.J. & Pullig, C. (2013). I'm number one! does narcissism impair ethical judgment even for the highly religious?. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 112 (1) 167-176.
- [23] Corben, R. (2017). Global Trend in Counterfeting and Piracy. <https://www.voanews.com/a/global-trend-in-counterfeiting-andpiracy/3783360.html>. (Accessed 11 January 2017).
- [24] Coyle, J.R., & Thorson, E. (2001). The effects of progressive levels of interactivity and vividness in web marketing sites. *Journal of Advertising*, 30(3), 65–77.

- [25] Felsten, G., (2009). Where to take a study break on the college campus: an attention restoration theory perspective. *Journal Environmental Psychology* 29 (1)160–167.
- [26] Fortin, D.R., & Dholakia, R.R. (2005). Interactivity and vividness effects on social presence and involvement with a web-based advertisement. *Journal of Business Research*, 58(3), 387–396.
- [27] Faqih, K. M. (2016). An empirical analysis of factors predicting the behavioral intention to adopt Internet shopping technology among non-shoppers in a developing country context: does gender matter? *Journal Retailing Consumer Services*, 30,140–164.
- [28] Frumkin, H., (2003). Healthy places: exploring the evidence. *American Journal Public Health* 93 (9),1451–1456.
- [29] Google & Temasek (2017). Retrieved form: <https://www.techinasia.com/google-temasek-internet-economy-2017>.
- [30] Groß, M. (2016). Impediments to mobile shopping continued usage intention: A trust-risk-relationship. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 33,109–119.
- [31] Groß, M. (2018). Heterogeneity in consumers' mobile shopping acceptance: A finite mixture partial least squares modelling approach for exploring and characterizing different shopper segments. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 40, 8–18.
- [32] Hoffman, D.L., & Novak, T.P. (1996). Marketing in hypermedia computer mediated environments: conceptual foundations. *Journal of Marketing*, 60(3), 50–68.
- [33] Idler, E. (2008). The psychological and physical benefits of spiritual/religious practices. Retrieve from: http://spirituality.ucla.edu/docs/newsletters/4/idler_final.pdf. (June 28th 2016).
- [34] Joye, Y., Willems, K., Brengman, M., & Wolf, K. (2010). The effects of urban greenery on consumer experience: Reviewing the evidence from a restorative perspective. *Urban Forum, Urban Green*. 9(1), 57–64.
- [35] Jamal, M. (2011). Konsep Al-Islam dalam AlQur'an. *Jurnal Al-Ulum*, 11 (2), 283- 310.
- [36] Jiang, L., & Cova, V. (2012). Love for luxury, preference for counterfeits A qualitative study in counterfeit luxury consumption in China. *International Journal Marketing Studies*, 4(6),1-9.
- [37] Kamarulzaman, Y. Veeck, A., Mumuni, A. G., Luqmani, M., & Quraeshi, Z. A. (2018). Religion, Markets, and Digital Media: Seeking Halal Food in the U.S. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 36(4), 400-411.
- [38] Kaplan, S. (1989). Aesthetics, affect, and cognition: environmental preference from an evolutionary perspective. *Environmental Behavior*, 19(1),3–32.
- [39] Kaplan, S. (1995). The restorative benefits of nature: toward an integrative framework. *Journal Environmental Psychology*, 15(3),69–182.
- [40] Kaplan, S. (2001). Mediation, restoration, and the management of mental fatigue. *Environment Behavior*, 33(4),480 – 506.
- [41] Lai, K.K.Y., & Zaichkowsky, J.L. (1999). Brand imitation: do the Chinese have different views? *Asia Pacific Journal Management*, 16 (2), 179–192.
- [42] Larson, D. B., Pattison, E. M., Blazer, D. G., Omran, A. R., & Kaplan, B. H. (1986). Systematic analysis of research on religious variables in four major psychiatric journals. 1978-1982. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 143: 329-334.
- [43] Levin, J. S. (1997). Religious research in gerontology, 1980- 1984: A systematic review. *Journal of Religious Gerontology*, 10(3): 3-31.
- [44] Levin, J. S., & Puchalski, C. M. (1997). Religion and spirituality in medicine: Research and education. *Journal of the American Medical Association*, 278: 792-793.
- [45] Lissitsa, S., & Kol, O. (2016). Generation X vs. Generation Y—A decade of online shopping. *Journal Retailing Consumer Services*, 31, 304–312.
- [46] Liu, Y. (2003). Developing a scale to measure the interactivity of websites. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 43(2), 207–216.
- [47] Lotz, S.L., Eastlick, M.A., Mishra, A., & Shim, S. (2010). Understanding patrons' participation in activities at entertainment malls: a study in “flow”. *International Journal Retailing Distribution Management*, 38(6),402–422.
- [48] McMillan, S.J., (2005). The researchers and the concept: moving beyond a blind examination of interactivity. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, 5(2) 1-4.
- [49] Morrin, M., & Chebat, J.C. (2005). Person-place congruency: The interactive effects of shopper style and atmospherics on consumer expenditures. *Journal Services Research*, 8(2), 181–191.
- [50] Morreall, J., & Tamara, S. (2013). "Myth 1: All Societies Have Religions". 50 Great Myths of Religion. Wiley-Blackwell, 12–17.
- [51] Mower, J.M., Kim, M., & Childs, M.L., (2012). Exterior atmospherics and consumer behavior: Influence of landscaping and window display. *Journal Fashion Marketing Management*, 16(4),442–453.
- [52] Nejdert, D. (2000). International counterfeit marketing: Success without risk. *Review of Business*; Spring 2000; 21, 1/2; ABI/INFORM Complete,16.
- [53] Nedra, B. A., Hadri, W., & Mezrani, M. (2018). Determinants of customers' intentions to use

- hedonic networks: The case of Instagram. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 46,21–32.
- [54] Nielsen, (2014). State of the Shopping Center. (<http://www.nielsen.com/us/en/insights/reports/2014/2014-state-of-the-shopping-center.html>) (Accessed 17 May 2015).
- [55] Nielsen, 2016. Global connected commerce. In: *Is E-tail Therapy the New Retail Therapy*. Available at: <http://www.nielsen.com/content/dam/corporate/us/en/reportsdownloads/2016-reports/connected-commerce-report-jan-2016.pdf> (accessed 7 August 2017).
- [56] Nongbri, B. (2013). *Before Religion: A History of a Modern Concept*. Yale University Press.
- [57] Nsairi, Z.B., (2012). Managing browsing experience in retail stores through perceived value: implications for retailers. *International Journal Retail Distribution Management*, 40(9), 676–698.
- [58] Nwankwo, S., Hamelin, N., & Khaled, M. (2014). Consumer values, motivation and purchase intention for luxury goods. *Journal Retailer Consumer Service*, 21(5), 735–744.
- [59] Pantano, E., & Priporas, C.V. (2016). The effect of mobile retailing on consumers' purchasing experiences: a dynamic perspective. *Computer Humanies Behavior*, 61(8), 548–555.
- [60] Park, C., Jun, J.K., & Lee, T.M. (2015). Do mobile shoppers feel smart in the smartphone age? *International Journal Mobile Communication*, 13(2), 157–171.
- [61] Phau, I., Sequeira, M., & Dix, S. (2009). To buy or not to buy a “counterfeit” Ralph Lauren polo shirt: The role of lawfulness and legality toward purchasing counterfeits. *Asia-Pacific Journal Business Administration*, 1(1), 68–80.
- [62] Purwanto, P, Margiati L, Kuswandi K, and Prasetyo B (2019) Consumer motives for purchasing counterfeit luxury products: behind the status signaling behavior using brand prominence. *Business: Theory and Practice* 20: 208-215.
- [63] Purwanto, P. and Kuswandi (2017). Effects of Flexibility and Interactivity on the Perceived Value of and Satisfaction with E-Commerce (Evidence from Indonesia). *Market-Tržište*, 29 (2), 139-159.
- [64] Rawwas, M.Y.A., Vitell, S.J. and Al-Khatib, J.A. (1994). Consumer ethics: the possible effects of terrorism and civil unrest on the ethical values of consumers. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 13(3), 223-231.
- [65] Reynolds, K.E., Jones, M.A., Musgrove, C.F., & Gillison, S.T. (2012). An investigation of retail outcomes comparing two types of browsers. *Journal Business Research*, 65(8),1090–1095.
- [66] Riquelme, H. E., Sayed-Abbas, E. M. & Rios, R,E, (2012). Intention to purchase fake products in an Islamic country. *Education, Business and Society: Contemporary Middle Eastern Issues*, 5(1), 6 - 22.
- [67] Rodriguez-Rad, C. J. & Ramos-Hidalgo, E. (2018). Spirituality, consumer ethics, and sustainability: the mediating role of moral identity. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 35(1), 51- 63.
- [68] Rosenbauma, M.S, Ramirez, G.C., & Camino, J.R. (2018). A dose of nature and shopping: The restorative potential of biophilic lifestyle center designs. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 40, 66–73.
- [69] Rosenbaum, M.S., & Smallwood, J. (2013). Cancer resource centers as third places. *Journal Services Marketing*, 27(6), 472–484.
- [70] Terrapin, (2012). The Economics of Biophilia: Why Designing with Nature in Mind Makes Financial Sense. (<https://www.terrapinbrightgreen.com/report/economics-of-biophilia/>) (Accessed 17 July 2018).
- [71] Tifferet, S., & Vilnai-Yavetz, I., (2017). Phytophilia and service atmospherics: the effect of indoor plants on consumers. *Environment Behavior*, 49(7),814–844.
- [72] Shaw, D. & Clarke, I. (1999). Belief Formation in Ethical Consumer Groups: An Exploratory Study, *Marketing Intelligence and Planning*, 17(2), 109-119.
- [73] Söderlund, J., & Newman, P. (2015). Biophilic architecture: a review of the rationale and outcomes. *AIMS Environment Science*, 2(4),950–969.
- [74] Stack, K., & Shultis, J. (2013). Implications of attention restoration theory for leisure planners and managers. *Leisure*, 37 (1),1–16.
- [75] Stöttinger, B., & Penz, E. (2015). Concurrent ownership of brands and counterfeits: conceptualization and temporal transformation from a consumer perspective. *Psychology Marketing*, 32, 373–391.
- [76] Tauber, E.M., 1972. Why do people shop? *Journal Marketing*, 36 (4),46–49.
- [77] Tang, F., Tian, V.I. & Zaichkowsky, J. (2014) Understanding counterfeit consumption. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 26(1), 4-20.
- [78] Thaichon, P., & Quach, S. (2016). Dark motives counterfeit purchase framework: Internal and external motives behind counterfeit purchase via digital platforms. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 33,82–91.
- [79] Tjahjono, G. (2014). Religiosity and the Intention to Buy Luxury Goods Among Young Indonesian Muslims in Jakarta retrieve. <http://researchdirect.uws.edu.au/islandora/object/uws%3A34629/datastream/PDF/view>.

- [80] Tontini, G. (2016). Identifying opportunities for improvement in online shopping sites. *Journal Retailing Consumer Services*, 31, 228–238.
- [81] Vitell, S. J. (2009). The Role of Religiosity in Business and Consumer Ethics: A Review of the Literature. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 90, 155–167.
- [82] Vitell, S.J., Paolillo, J.G. & Singh, J.J. (2005). Religiosity and consumer ethics. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 57(2), 175-181.
- [83] Verde & Wharton, (2015). The 2015 Customer Experience Study Reveals Billions at Risk for Retailers from Negative CX. (<http://www.verdegroupp.com/viewpoints/verdewharton-research/>) (Accessed 17 May 2016).
- [84] Wang, R.J.H., Malthouse, E.C., & Krishnamurthi, L. (2015). On the Go: how mobile shopping affects customer purchase behavior. *Journal Retailing*, 91(2), 217–234.
- [85] Wong, C.H., Lee, H.S., Lim, Y.S., Chua, B.H., & Tan, G.W.H. (2012). Predicting the consumers' intention to adopt mobile shopping: an emerging market perspective. *International Journal Network Mobile Technology*, 3(2), 24–39.
- [86] Yoo, W., S., Yunjung, L., & Jung K. P. (2010). The role of interactivity in e-tailing: Creating value and increasing satisfaction. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 17, 89–96.
- [87] Yan, N., & Eckman, M. (2009). Are lifestyle centres unique? Consumers' perceptions across locations. *International Journal Retailing Distribution Management*. 37(1), 24–42.