

Striving to Implement Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) Policies and Practices: A Study from HR Managers Perspective (FMCG Sector)

Qusai Saifuddin¹, Faizan Hussain², Iqbal Uddin Khan³
Faculty of Management Sciences SZABIST University, Karachi, Pakistan¹
FEST Hamdard University, Karachi, Pakistan^{2&3}
Qusaimorris@gmail.com¹
faizanhussain535@outlook.com²
Iqbaluddin.khan@hamdard.edu.pk³

Abstract- The purpose of this research is to explore the implementation of Green Human Resource Management practices and policies by the FMCG manufacturing companies of Pakistan. The researchers have enlightened various Green HRM strategies, initiatives, and practices that HR managers have undertaken in their respective organizations. Also, this research highlights the significance of Green HR practices and policies in employee retention, organizational citizenship behaviour and overall organizational image. This research is exploring the perception of Green HR from the HR professionals associated with FMCG companies of Karachi. For this purpose, in-depth interviews were taken by the HR managers of targeted companies to explore the implementation of HR practices and policies in Pakistan. The interview was conducted with the help of an interview protocol, consisting of various open-ended questions based on research objectives and research questions. The findings of this research suggest that the concept of Green HR practices and its benefits that an organization can gain by implementing such practices is vague among the HR professionals of Pakistan. The research has identified the need to train the managers regarding the Green HR initiatives and develop awareness campaigns which guide the managers about the significance that green practices have on the overall organizational performance and its image in the industry.

General Terms- Management; Managers; Human Resource.

Keywords- Green Human Resources Management (GHRM); Environmental Sustainability.

1. INTRODUCTION

Recently, it is observed that organizations are showing heightened interest in the environmental concern either they belong to NGO, politics, or business. People are also getting more conscious regarding the well-being of the environment after analyzing the impact of extreme climate. Going green is the new practice which has been adopted by most of the well-known organizations all around the world. To implement green (eco-friendly) practices or taking green initiatives, organizations are striving to integrate all the functional departments since it cannot be implemented in isolation. Human resource deals with most critical and asset of an organization which is human asset. Unless and until employees are not aware or responsible towards the environment and society, all other initiatives taken by the operational concerns will go in vein. Therefore, to implement any corporate environmental program it's necessary to implement green practices internally in the organization. This study exclusively focuses on the green human resource management (GHRM) in which the human resource is responsible to manage the environment with in the organization and ensure the efficient use of resources (Mampra, 2013)[22]. Here all the HRM activities, programs, initiatives will be considered in terms of environmental sustainability. In the 1990s, organizational interest was increased on greening strategies and practices due to the certain legislations imposed by the government (Jabbour & Jabbour, 2016)[16]. After the launch of ISO 14001, companies realised the implications of greening strategies to sustain in the industry and soon they realised the significance of the role of human resource support (such as training, performance evaluation and rewards system) in achieving this environmental sustainability goal (Main Uddin & Islam, 2015)[21]. In early 90s people were not aware from the greening strategies and that was the time to train the employees with greening practices and simultaneously motivate them by offering rewards for the enactment of any initiative taken for the efficient use of resources which apparently decrease the impact of doing business on the environment (Longoni, Luzzini, & Guerci, 2018)[20]. Until 2008, organizational success was hard to find in the integration of human resource with environmental sustainability, due to this fact researchers had started including the connection of human resource with



environmental sustainability or greening practices and initiatives. At that time, the term Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) was coined for the first time (Birou, Green, & Inman, 2019)[5]. In 2011 (Jackson, 2011) organised special issue for the first time on green human resource management, after which researches on GHRM become more common and many studies were drawn to justify the dependency of green practices on human resource management (Jabbour & Jabbour, 2016)[16].

In this context, many studies have consensus on the relevancy of human resource support for all the phases of environmental growth (starting from the environmental policy to the analysis of the result), according to (Priya & Shree, 2019)[28] human resource practices (Recruiting, training, evaluating and rewarding) not only support environmental efficiency but it also support smooth product development and overall growth of the organization, simultaneously if any organization tends to take initiatives for environmental well-being it will increase the positive image of the organization in the minds of the customer and employees simultaneously which positively impact the brand equity of the organization and increase Organizational Citizenship Behaviour (OCB) (Chaudhary, 2018)[9]. Green Human (GHRM) Resource Management involves conventional human resource practices (recruiting, hiring, training, evaluating, managing, organizing, rewarding, rotation, motivating and firing) align with environmental sustainability goals (Shah, 2019)[34]. The concept of GHRM allows the organization to build organizational culture with respect to environmental well-being, it builds and develop the personality of the personnel's which strive to find eco-friendly alternative for every procedure and process either in the organization or outside the organization (Saeed, et al., 2018)[32]. Recruitment process aims to attract the candidate who is passionate about environmental sustainability and selection process will select the right candidate for the green organization (Ahmad, 2015)[1]. While training was the first topic which was introduced in the 90s in order to train the employees regarding the significance of green practices and make them efficient user of scarce resources (Nejati, Rabiei, & Jabbour, 2017)[25]. Performance evaluation and rewards systems are aligned with achievement of environmental goals within the organization on behalf of an individual employee. Simultaneously environmental empowerment is essential to make sure that employees have authority to take complex decisions in terms of environment (Tang, Chen, Jiang, Paillé, & Jia, 2017)[36]. After understanding the concept of GHRM by the researchers in 2012, one of the challenges is to understand the connectivity of GHRM and GSCM (Green Supply Chain Management) due to the fact that no environmental initiative can be taken into account with the efficiency and effectivity of supply chain management (Jabbour & Jabbour, 2016)[16].

1.1 Problem and Purpose of Study

The Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) influences significantly the organizations for the implementation and promotions of green practices and simultaneously training the employees for green policies and practices, it helps employers to create positive image in the industry by strictly following the ISO14000 standards (changing organization culture, management, minimize carbon foot prints and pollution spreading processes). Greening is an emerging concept around the globe which helps organizations to achieve corporate and societal profitability simultaneously. People are getting aware from the greening concept and start inclining towards the green products or prefer the products or services of the organizations which contribute to the society over the organizations which only focus on the profitability and cost efficiency. Government is also imposing certain legislation regarding environmental wellbeing due to which it becomes necessary for the manufacturing companies to strive for alternative material, processes or procedure and it cannot be possible without hiring the right person who is personally concern with environment. Since, Pakistan comes under the umbrella of developing country and it cannot possible for the organizations to only focus on environmental sustainability due to high global competition. Therefore, this study aims to explore such green strategies by virtue of which organizations can achieve corporate and social goals simultaneously. Furthermore, proposed research is exploring the concept and role of Green Human Resource Management in achieving sustainability goals. This study highlights the significance of GHRM in this era, where most of the well-known organizations are striving to position their organization on the basis green initiatives. Conventional HRM is all about hiring the right person for the right job and sustain that employee after it becomes a useful resource of the company through various activities, while GHRM is also executing the same functions but aligned with environmental concern, GHRM will evaluate every aspect based on green aspect.

1.2 Research Objective

This study significantly observant the following objectives:

- To explore the challenges of green human resource management in emerging economy of Pakistan.
- To identify the implementation of green human resource policies.
- To gauge the perception of green human resource management from human resource managers.
- To understand significance of green human resource management in building strong organizational image.
- To determine the advantage of GHRM over conventional HRM.

1.3 Research Rationale and Scope

This study helps the HR managers and organizations to implement green strategies and build a competitive



advantage in the industry over rivals. Extreme climatic change is a top concern of the world, due to which government and global environmental associations are imposing certain legislation which should be followed by the companies to sustain in the industry. Pakistan which comes under the developing countries of the world, already must face a lot of red tapes while executing business practices due to various reasons. Therefore, it is not possible for the companies and managers to focus on the green activities separately which can lead to extra cost consumption. Hence, proposed study enables the organizations to implement such strategies, policies and practices which will not lead to extra time and cost consumption while fulfilling the goals of environmental sustainability. Furthermore, the scope of the research has been demarcated below;

- Proposed study is restricted to Karachi only.
- This study is restricted to FMCG sector only, therefore it cannot be generalized on other industries.
- Due to limited time given for the research, researcher had only able to approach few FMCG's organization based on the convenience.

1.4 Definitions of Keywords

1.4.1 Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) Green human resource management (GHRM) can be defined as human resource management process in which environmental sustainability is a key element. There main concern is to design such policies which encourage the environmental well-being and efficient use of resources within the organization and in general as well. This implementation of policies and strategies cannot be possible without hiring the right person who is aware from the green processes and simultaneously creating awareness among the existing employees to encourage their environmental concern (Main Uddin & Islam, 2015)[21].

1.4.2 Environmental Sustainability

"Environmental sustainability is to meet the present needs of resources while keeping in view the future needs of the generation", this is usually called efficient use of resources which can help in saving existing resources for future generation (Ahmad, 2015)[1]. Environmental sustainability is to take initiatives to alter or modify present processes of doing business into the processes that are less harmful to the environment (including hiring, space allocation, manufacturing, procuring, delivering etc.).

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature review of the proposed study focuses on the past researched done on Green Human Resource Management (GHRM). It is highlighting the benefits and factors to increase the organizational image in the industry which motivates the organizations to emphasis on the adoption of green human resource practices. It is also exploring the employee-oriented strategies which managers can implement for the development of successful green practices with in the organization:

2.1 Green Human Resource (GHRM)

In the current situation organizations must dealt with economic issues as well as ecological issues, to attain profit for the shareholders and improve the economic performance of the organization, companies need to take various ecological initiatives simultaneously with economic initiatives (Birou, Green, & Inman, 2019)[5]. Green human resource management is defined as "the use of human resource policies and strategies to develop an internal atmosphere within the organization to implement sustainable use of organizational resources which motivate the employees to contribute towards environmentalism" (Burritt & Schaltegger, 2018)[7]. To ensure successful implementation of both aspects there must be concrete internal process within the organization (Ahmad, 2015)[2]. Environmental issues are on top list of the industry leaders due to the fact that people are getting well aware from the concept and significance of greening (Mampra, 2013)[22], incorporating green strategies with corporate strategies is an art which is still far away from some HR managers (Ahmad, 2015)[1]. According to (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15] integration of green strategies and objectives with strategic development goals increases the chance of better performance of environmental management system. Murari & Bhandari, (2011) stated that organizations have keep balance between economic prosperity and environmental prosperity because it has been proven by many researches that green practices increase overall corporate profitability (Saeed, et al., 2018)[32]. In the process of the development of this ecoorganizational culture, human resource management plays a significant role (Chaudhary, 2018)[9]. It is observed that the more the green human resource policies the greater will be chance to implement green initiatives and to adopt more environmental management systems (EWS) (Tang, Chen, Jiang, Paillé, & Jia, 2017)[36].

Green initiatives consist a major part of corporate social responsibility in HRM. Green HRM is comprised of two major elements, one is HR practices and other is knowledge capital (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8]. In any organization HR is the most essential departmental function which is responsible to implement any sort of practices either it a financial business or sustainable business, HR is the one who is responsible to execute and develop any plan of action in terms of human capital because whatever initiative is taken by any department cannot be possible without the consensus of human resource (Cheema & Javed, 2017)[10]. In fact, without facilitating human resource, implementation of green strategies or policies would be impossible (Ehnert, Parsa, Roper, Wagner, & 'Muller-Cammen, 2015)[11]. The incorporation of environmental strategies and objectives with overall business strategy helps to manage and establish an efficient and effective environmental management system (EMS) (Bhutto, 2016)[4]. Many researchers have explored that the implementation of green policies motivates the employees and increase their loyalty

and productivity which result in high overall business efficiency and productivity (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8]. Various policies of recruitment, hiring, training and development, performance, reward system, appraisal management and employee relation are considered as an effective tool for incorporating employee strategy with environmental strategy (Ehnert, Parsa, Roper, Wagner, & `Muller-Cammen, 2015)[11]. Many professionals have argued that to have an effective environmental management system within the organization its significant to provide the employees with a set of certain skills and technical support which ensure efficient use of resources and prove as a competitive advantage in the industry for an organization (Gholami, Rezaei, Saman, Sharif, & Zakuan, 2016)[12]. Therefore, to have such a framework within the organization it's essential to have effective human resource management (Ehnert, Parsa, Roper, Wagner, & 'Muller-Cammen, 2015)[11]. There must be a proper reward system, appraisal system, employees training and development regarding environmental issues which enable management to enjoy unique set of employee's skills, main function of GHRM is to create awareness among the employees about environmental sustainability, and let them know that what actions must be needed to execute such practices and how it can be benefit their personal goals as well as societal goals and organizational goals (Chaudhary, 2018)[9].

2.2 Green HRM Functions

Green human resource management is a platform which helps to develop a green workforce that can understand and establish green environment within the organization, it's important to maintain green aspect throughout the human resource process (recruiting, hiring, training, compensating, development and advancement) of company's human asset (Guerci, Luzzini, & Longoni, 2016)[12]. HR representatives have significant contribution in developing green culture in the organization (Gholami, Rezaei, Saman, Sharif, & Zakuan, 2016)[12]. Due to this fact human resource and its management is essential for the better management of environmental system (EMS) (Guerci, Luzzini, & Longoni, 2016)[13]. Haddockmillar, Mullercamen, & Sanyal, (2016)[14] Stated that HR management should strive to align its policies and practices with EMS objectives to achieve overall organizational green objectives, simultaneously HR functions should also be aligned with each other to increase the probability of having green environment. Recruiting, training and rewards are the basic pillars for the employee implementation of green practices (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. To have a right person for green job performance and green inputs it is crucial to modify HRM objectives to green objectives (Bombiak & Kluska, 2018)[6].

2.2.1 Green Recruitment

Enchanting efficient personnel for the organization is the basic and most essential function of human resource management (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. Organizations have started realising that having a green image of the employer helps to retain current employees and to attract new employees (Cheema & Javed, 2017)[10]. Organization such as, BASF, Siemens, Bayer and Mannesmann attract well performing staff based on environmental activities they execute to create a green image in the society (Birou, Green, & Inman, 2019)[5]. Many well-known organizations have made environmental knowledge as a part of their job description, this increasing demand of environmental knowledge has become a new agenda of recruitment (Kim J., 2018)[18]. Green recruiting is a process in which the focus is on the knowledge of the applicant regarding eco-friendly processes and his/her personal will to work for a green organization (Urbaniak, 2017)[39]. This intake of such professional who already aware from the environmental issues and are ready to contribute to the society makes easy to implement green policies through which organizations easily achieve their green objectives (Roscoe, Subramanian, Jabbour, & Chong, 2019)[31].

2.2.2 Green Performance Management

Performance management system is a process through which employees are triggered to enhance their skill set to be a noticeable person of an organization (Kim, Kim, Han, Jackson, & Polyhart, 2017)[17]. Similarly, green performance management is a process developed by the human resource base on the implementation and following of green policies and green initiatives taken by the individuals in an organization (Zaid, Jarron, & Bon, 2018)[40]. The most significant element of a performance management is performance appraisal, performance appraisal is the reward system based on the performance evaluation of employees (Taylor & Medina, 2013)[38]. When it comes to green performance management then in that case it caters all the elements based on the environmental well-being, simultaneously evaluation will also be done based on green policies and initiatives (Cheema & Javed, 2017)[10]. Many researchers have pointed out that performance appraisal for taking green initiatives and following green policies, rules and regulations have proved an essential tool to implement green environment within the organization (Roscoe, Subramanian, Jabbour, & Chong, 2019)[31]. Human resource representatives should alter the performance appraisal criteria by aligning it with environmental issues, such as rating employees on following instructions, brainstorming for green initiative, inclined behaviour environmental sustainability, technical towards competencies, and teamwork collaboration in order to impose collaborative effort for green policies in the organization. These strategies will help human resource to reinforce the motivation in the employees by creating a green internal environment within the organization (Haddockmillar, Mullercamen, & Sanyal, 2016)[14]. Human resource managers should integrate with functional managers to make them aware about the performance of their team members all around the year so that managers



can render the feedback to the employees not only at the schedule time but whenever it is needed to improve their knowledge, skills and ability (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8].

2.2.3 Green Training and Development

Training and development are an important function of human resource which plays significant role in implementing environmental management system (EMS), training and development mainly focus on the training and development of the employee's skills, knowledge, technical abilities, customer interaction skills, attitude, teamwork (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. To implement EMS these elements of training development must be aligned with environmental education, like human resource should train the employees that how they could make efficient use of resources within the organization, give them education about environmental issues, divert their attitude towards green practices and developed their personality as a green personality through which they could be able to not only execute green practices but also communicate the benefits of such practices to the customer and in the surroundings which will create a positive image of the organization and helps to attract high quality personnel's (Taylor & Medina, 2013)[38].

2.2.4 Green Compensation

Compensation or rewards either monitory or non-monitory are significant functions of HRM, it's always believed that reward based on the performance of employees is the best mean to link employee goals with organizational goals (Bhutto, 2016)[4]. Incentives allow the employer to take the maximum from the employee and simultaneously motivate the employees to exert their maximum to achieve organizational goal (Ehnert, Parsa, Roper, Wagner, & `Muller-Cammen, 2015)[11]. In Green HRM, compensation and rewards system are considered as an imperative tool to encourage employees for eco-friendly practices and initiatives. It is observed that employee participation in the implementation of eco-friendly initiatives increase when employees are awarded with certain types of rewards and compensation (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. Saifulina & Carballo-Penela, (2017)[33] found in their research that eco-friendly organizations pays more to their CEO's than non-ecofriendly organizations. On one side rewards and compensation prove to be effective for the implementation of green initiatives, simultaneuosly on the other side it becomes difficult to evaluate the performance accurately which created sense of discrimination among the employees and demotivate them to give their best (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. Hence, companies should design their processes to be green and associate allowances with their acceptance (Burritt & Schaltegger, 2018)[7]. Green rewards include (efficient use of workplace, green modification in lifestyle, initiative in carbon footprints reduction, sustainable designing and processes, green products, green marketing) (Cheema & Javed, 2017)[10].

2.2.5 Green Employee Relations

Employee relation is a function of HRM which is concerned with cordial relation between employee and employer. It helps the employer to increase the engagement of employees with organizational goals and increase their productivity (Bombiak & Kluska, 2018)[6]. In fact, strong employee and employer relationship is a source of competitive advantage in the industry in which it operates (Chaudhary, 2018)[9]. Due to the strong relation between employees and employer, it increases the involvement of employees in green initiatives which apparently result in effective Environment Management EM (Jabbour & Jabbour, 2016)[16]. Many researches have concluded that employee individual empowerment in the organization results in high performance and productivity, increases self-control and individual thinking (Ahmad S., 2015)[2]. Increment in these elements of HRM result in high chances to achieve organization goals either it's a business-oriented goals or green strategic goals (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8]. Achievement of green outcomes is strongly dependent on the employees willing for the participation in structuring organizational green strategies (Longoni, Luzzini, & Guerci, 2018)[20]. In order to increase the involvement of employees in green initiatives it's essential to encourage eco-entrepreneurs (who have better know how regarding environmental sustainability) in the organization (Kramar, 2014)[19]. The role of HRM in the development of friendly environment in the organization is to encourage the management to allow employees to put up their ideas freely without any hesitation (Guerci, Luzzini, & Longoni, 2016)[13]. Another scheme for active participation of the employees is the development of such program where employee of the top most designation to the lowest designation encourages participating and sharing their viewpoints and ideas regarding green issues and what counter initiatives could be possible (Main Uddin & Islam, 2015)[21].

2.3 Green Human Resource Initiatives

Green human resource initiatives considered as corporate social responsibility in long-term; organizations are striving to implement and integrate green initiatives in the organizations with the help of human resource where managers make sure the proper utilization of green human resource practices (Mampra, 2013)[22]. In today's world when people and organizations are getting aware from the climatic change, most of the organizations are striving to implement green practices which can play a role of competitive advantage for them (Zaid, Jarron, & Bon, 2018)[40]. Key role of environmental representatives is to guide the functional managers about educating the employees and getting their full support for implementation of green practices to change the status quo (Marhatta & Adhikari, 2013)[23].



2.3.1 Green Building

Many organizations around the globe is transforming their traditional offices into green buildings, it not only cost effective but it gives positive image to the organization as well. Green building is the efficient use of resources which require certain activities to be executed during construction which will benefit in the long-term and enhance various features including, waste management, daylight warehouses, water management (Zaid, Jarron, & Bon, 2018)[40].

2.3.2 Paperless Office

The advent of technology has reduced the use of paper to high extent; previously most of the work was done on paper which is now taken over by various ERP systems and inter-organizational systems incorporated with various information technology software's (Longoni, Luzzini, & Guerci, 2018)[20]. In the well-known organizations either the use of paper is restricted or completely eliminated, this not only save the paper but it also saves a lot of time and cost associated with usage of paper (printing, sorting, storing) (Longoni, Luzzini, & Guerci, 2018)[20].

2.3.3 Conservation of Energy

Conservation of energy at workplace has a significant influence on reducing the impact of doing business on the environmental and leads to environmental sustainability at workplace (Shah, 2019)[34]. World's renowned organizations have implemented several energy related initiatives such as, switching off the electronic appliance while leaving office, car sharing, installation of solar panels to make use of renewable energy, constructing daylight warehouses (Roscoe, Subramanian, Jabbour, & Chong, 2019)[31]. These initiatives have a positives impact on the profitability as well since all these initiatives will help to save overheads of running an organization (Arulrajah & Opatha, 2016)[3].

2.3.4 Recycling

Recycling is the process of reusing disposal material through reverse engineering, it helps to reduce the wastage of resources and contribute to environmental sustainability by reusing vulnerable materials (Bombiak & Kluska, 2018)[6]. Since, recycling is considered as a part of green initiative; therefore, many organizations have adopted recycling processes to reduce and increase the efficiency of waste management system (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8].

2.4 Gap Analysis

Discussed literature review extracted from various researches have enlighten the significance of Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) for the development of sustainable business practices, it is also evident from this; the concept of green human resource management GHRM is vague in Pakistan, many few researches have been done in this context which increase the need to explore more about GHRM. Numerous researches have been done in environmental sustainability, due to immense need for green initiatives. Green

marketing, green supply chain, green manufacturing, green transportation; these are the areas which are well explored in terms of green practices, polices and initiatives (Ren, Tang, & Jackson, 2018)[30], but when it comes to Green HRM there are not sufficient researches available which are exploring the green policies, strategies and practices implemented by HRM and highlighting the contribution of human resource in making an organization to be a sustainable organization (Chams & Blandón, 2019)[8]. Many past studies have enlightened the corporate, societal and environmental advantages of green practices, but no research in the Pakistani context is highlighting the contribution of green initiatives and practices to the image of organizations in the mind of the consumer, simultaneously it helps to increase the brand equity and drag customer loyalty as well. Very few FMCG organizations are implementing such green practices and thoroughly following legislation in regards environmental sustainability, the reason to low response to this law enforcement is non-awareness among the business professionals which increase the responsibility of human resource to train the employees as much as possible. Usually, environmental concern is adopted in developed countries, but the major portion of world's manufacturing sector is in developing countries where there is not much awareness regarding environmental issues and Pakistan comes under the umbrella of developing countries where the main focus of businesses is to generate profit only regardless the impact of doing business on the society, therefore it's essential for developing countries to adopt green practices (Haden, Olyver, & Humphrey, 2009)[15]. On the other side, people are getting aware and interested in getting associated with organizations which are taking green initiatives. So in order to attract the right talent to enjoy competitive advantage in the industry, it's essential for the manufacturing firms of Pakistan to implement green environment within the organization and also market their green activities which will not only attract the talent but also increase the brand equity which apparently result in overall corporate profitability.

3 COMPREHENSIVE DISCUSSION

Content/Thematic analysis is a research tool used to analyses the qualitative data collected from the participants. In the proposed study, data has been collected from HR managers of various FMCG manufacturing organizations through in-depth interviews. After collecting relevant data from the participants, it has been coded, sorted and sighted based on following themes which are extracted from literature review and relevant information given by the participants in the correspondence of research objectives. Therefore, in Table .01 the theme section is addressing the themes of questions whereas R is representing the gathered responses.



Table .01 Responses and Evaluation

S. No	Theme	R1	R2	R3	R4
1.	Perception of Green HRM	Green HRM is a combination of human resource functions use to promote sustainable activities and practices in an organization	Incorporating sustainable practices in the HR policies to establish a green environment with in an organization	Designing and shaping HR policies which ensure efficient use of resources within the organization	Developing HR policies which encourage green environment and promote green initiatives taken by the employees
2.	Green Initiatives by HR	Organizing awareness campaigns for the employees regarding the efficient use of resources	Eliminating the use of paper and other vulnerable materials within the organization by integrating with the functional manager to explore an alternative use of material for the same purpose	Visiting to the operational areas with respective functional managers to ensure that employees are observing the compliance of green practices and initiatives provided by the HR.	incorporating functional managers with HR recruiting and reward management system to hire the right talent which can implement green initiative as well as perform the basic function effectively
3.	Green HR Policies	Green performance management in which employee performance is evaluated in terms of green compliance provided by the HR and green pay and rewards for any initiative taken by an employee which can reduce impact of doing business on the society	Reducing the use of paper by implementing digital technology with the correspondence of functional managers, also saving energy resources by enforcing the employees to manage their work in the working ours	Designing recruitment criteria on green awareness while recruiting HR professionals and conduct internal audit for eco-friendly practices in operations and within the premises of office	Encouraging teleconferences instead of travelling for the inter-office meetings to reduce the carbonfoot prints and encourage the use of bio degradable materials in the office.
4.	Influence of Green HRM on Organizational Image	Green HRM significantly influence the organizational image and helps to attract fresh talent from well-known universities of Pakistan	Green HRM leads to organizational citizenship behaviour of the employees which ultimately create positive image in the society and results in increased brand equity Table .01 Responses	Green HRM will not influenced the image of an organization until and unless the green activities and initiatives are marketed through green marketing programs or with the help of employees and Evaluation	Yes, if Green HRM is integrated with other functional areas then it will lead to positive image of an organization plus enables the firm to achieve cost effectiveness by adopting technology and alternative processes



Conventional HRM develop a culture which helps to retain the employees and focus on Conventional HRM is a the employee's process of recruiting, Green HRM focus on satisfaction while hiring, firing, performance the efficient use of Incorporating balancing their inter Green HRM V/S evaluation, reward and pay resources within the environmental concern equity of the department; 5. system, while Green HRM organization whereas with the conventional Conventional however, Green HRM is is also the same but they HRM conventional HRM HRM functions is also same but it creates a incorporate environmental ensures the employee green HRM green culture within the sustainability with every productivity only organization and function evaluate the employees based upon their contribution to the environment **Green Initiatives** taken by any Functional 6. Department Yes Yes Yes Yes helps is Accomplishing CSR Goals Green HRM creates a lively environment within In the Pakistani context, people are the organization and It helps to develop Yes, Green HRM Role of Green employees consider positive image of an more inclined towards might play essential the monetary benefits, HRM in themselves to be organization which 7. role in bringing contributing to the society **Employee** ultimately influenced the because of this it hard intrinsic motivation which becomes a sense of Retention employee to retain with to say that green HRM among the employees motivation in them to organization will help to retain the employees continue their career with the same organization Training & **Development of** 8. Yes Yes Yes No **Employees for Green Initiatives** In Pakistani context, it Yes, it attracts especially could be not the Green HR Yes, since it is creating the fresh talent of the It could be one of essential factor; Policies is positive image of an industry which are essentiality but other however, it could be 9. Essential to organization so people will currently graduated factors are also one of the reasons to **Attract New** be loved to work with such because they have better significant in attracting motivate the fresh sense of environmental the new talent **Talent** companies talent to join the sustainability organization Green HR Policies and **Strategies** 10. Yes Yes Yes Yes **Contribute to** Cost **Effectiveness**



11.	Strategies for Green HRM	Compensating the employees on the success of their green initiative to encourage them, also prohibiting the use of such materials which cannot be recycle and promote the use of bio degradable materials	Performance management system which evaluate the employees based on their societal contribution keeping separate from the routine job performance	Integrating with the supply chain concerns of the organization to organize a training program of the employees where they can learn the importance of environment and implement that learning in their routine work	No strategies have been adopted yet, as there is no concept of Green HRM in the organization, however HR concerns tends to organize CSR activities
12.	Performance Appraisal & Reward System act as a Catalyst for GHRM	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
13.	Technological Adoption in Developing HR Systems	Digital HR helps to eliminate excessive use of resources and promote green environment in the organization	Technological implementation helps in achieving the green goals within the organization and in the operational activities	Digitalisation helps to monitor the green initiatives taken by the employees and integrate with functional managers to better implement the green practice	Digital performance evaluation systems help to evaluate overall performance of an employee which is a good thing initiative to be taken
14.	Green HRM is a Sustainable Competitive Advantage for an Organization	Yes	Yes	No	No
S. No	Theme	R5	R6	R7	R8
	Theme Perception of Green HRM	Recruiting the talent for an organization which is capable to implement green initiatives	R6 Combination of HR functions including recruiting, hiring, training and development and rewarding the employees based on green initiatives and practices taken by them	Developing a green culture within the organization to promote green initiatives taken as an individual or as a group	Creating awareness among the employees regarding the environmental sustainability and encouraging them to undertake green initiatives
No	Perception of	Recruiting the talent for an organization which is capable to implement green	Combination of HR functions including recruiting, hiring, training and development and rewarding the employees based on green initiatives and	Developing a green culture within the organization to promote green initiatives taken as an individual or as a	Creating awareness among the employees regarding the environmental sustainability and encouraging them to undertake green



			effectiveness	etc.	
4.	Influence of Green HRM on Organizational Image	Green HRM positively influence the image of an organization in the industry which helps to attract the right talent from the industry and help to increase the brand equity which will result in increased sales.	It helps to attract the consumers and fresh talent who keep culture and organizational environment as their priority	Green initiatives taken by the HR professionals develop a sense of responsibility among the employees towards the environment and society which positively influence their behaviour within and outside the organization	Green practices help the organization in creating a positive image in the minds of the consumer and simultaneously it also reduces the factory overheads which results in increased profitability in long- term
5.	Green HRM V/S Conventional HRM	Green HRM helps to attract fresh talent from the industry which is effective and possess know how about the efficient use of resources within the organization and in the operational activities as well	Conventional HRM and Green HRM are same, only Green HRM create awareness among the employees regarding the efficient use of resources from the environmental perspective whereas conventional HRM suggest them same but from cost perspective	Green HRM and Conventional HRM are both same, only difference is that one promotes environmental sustainability through HR functions and other promote cost effectiveness through HR functions	Not much idea about Green HRM, however developing a green culture within the organization by utilising HR functions can be said green HRM
6.	Green Initiatives taken by any Functional Department helps is Accomplishing CSR Goals	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.	Role of Green HRM in Employee Retention	It depends on the company overall performance evaluation system and other benefits provided to the employees; however only green environment is not enough to retain the employees	Yes, it is an additional value which can be added to the image of an organization which will motivate the employees to maintain their association with such organization	In the context of Pakistan, it is difficult to say that green initiatives will contribute to the employee retention	Employees are more concerned with their personal growth in terms of monetary and in terms of designation. So, it could not be essential for the employee retention
8.	Training & Development of Employees for Green Initiatives	No	Yes	No	No
9.	Green HR Policies is Essential to Attract New Talent	Yes, it essential to attract new talent by marketing the good image and good work of an organization	New comers in the industry might attracted from such activities	Young youth is more concerned with environmental sustainability, so such green practices will help the HR professionals to attract them towards their organization	New talent is more focused towards the career growth irrespective of the society
10.	Green HR Policies and Strategies Contribute to Cost Effectiveness	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
11.	Strategies for Green HRM	Casual token of appreciation is given to the	Participation of employees in the green	No such strategies have been adopted	No green HR strategies have been adopted yet



		employee who shows concern for the environment; however, HR concerns are striving to organize training programs where employees get increase their knowledge base and implement those learning in the operational activities	activities, additionally while hiring if any candidate has past background which shows his/her interest in environmental sustainability will become an advantage for that candidate	which can directly relate to the green practices; however, CSR activities have been carried out by the organization as a whole	by the existing HR professionals
12.	Performance Appraisal & Reward System act as a Catalyst for GHRM	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
13.	Technological Adoption in Developing HR Systems	Yes, online portals have been developed to manage the employees pay rolls and performance evaluation which helps to integrate with the employees and enable the HR to closely examine the problems faced by the employees as they can share their queries on that portal	Very little digitalisation exists in HR, in the context of Pakistan	It is essential for the implementation of green culture because green culture depends upon the digitalisation; however, not much technology have adopted by the management till now	Only payroll system is adopted and not more than that; however, management is planning is implement digital performance management system
14.	Green HRM is a Sustainable Competitive Advantage for an Organization	Yes	Yes	No	Yes

3.1 Discussion Analysis

This section of the study includes the discussion done with the participants to explore the justifiable reasoning which help the researcher to achieve the objectives of the proposed study.

3.1.1 Perception of Green Human Resource Management

After reviewing the information gathered by the HR managers of FMCG manufacturing companies, researcher has explored that most of the HR managers of FMCG companies perceive Green Human Resource Management as a combination of HR policies, practices and initiatives under taken with the help of HR functions (Recruitment, training and development, compensation and performance management and retention), incorporating the element of green environment in every function. Also, some of the participants shared their view point by quoting that "Green HRM is same as conventional HRM, but the main difference is that conventional human resource focus of the cost effective to maintain the internal quality of their department while Green HRM focus on the same, but by encouraging the efficient use of resources". However, after communicating with the HR professionals, researcher of the proposed study has analysed that the concept of green HRM is vague among the HR professionals of Pakistan, especially when it comes to FMCG sector. Most of the participants consider green HRM as a part of CSR activity instead of assuming it as a modern HRM based on efficient use of resources within the organizational which help the functional managers to hire the right person for the green initiatives.

3.1.2 Green HRM over Conventional HRM

Since, HR professionals of most of the FMCG organizations visited by the researcher do not have a clear concept of Green HRM except few of the participants; therefore, their preference is more inclined towards the conventional HRM. More of the participants believe that in the context of Pakistan, employees are least interested in the contribution to the environment; however, they are interest in doing work of charity and welfare. Due to these facts conventional HRM is more suitable to evaluate their performance and traditional retention strategies (e.g. intrinsic and extrinsic tools) will only help the HR managers to retain the employees in their organizations. On the other side, HR managers of some big FMCG companies which operates globally and have an idea of green culture, suggest that Green HRM policies such as green recruitment, green performance management and green training and development help an organization to promote the green culture which becomes an intrinsic tool of motivation which ultimately develop a sense of achievement in the employees and they feel that they are contributing something for the good of the society by working in this organization. These intrinsic feelings led them to stay with such organizations for a long period of. Additionally, culture created by the HR managers, help the functional managers to continuously innovate their



processes and procedure which result in the cost effectiveness; hence, increasing the profitability.

3.1.3 Implementation of Green HRM Strategies and Policies

Very few FMCG organizations are striving to implement Green HRM strategies in Pakistan. However, some participants shared that their organizations are mostly involved in the Corporate Social Responsibilities (CSR) activities but no specific HR policy has been established in their organization which could be said as green policy. On the other side, some of the participants from global organizations were agreed on the implementation of green policies and strategies. It was observed by the researcher while taking their interviews that they are implementing the green HR policies and strategies because their internal policies are based on the global standards which are followed by every branch in the world. Due to this reason of globalisation they were implementing some green HR strategies which include green compensation, green performance evaluation and green recruitment. The companies implementing green compensation use to award monetary or non- monetary reward to the employee taking any initiative which is in the favour of the internal organizational environment as well as external environment. These initiatives include efficient use of resources such as saving energy in the office, minimising the use of paper, encouraging the use of disposable utensils made from bio-degradable materials and also the initiatives taken by the operational staff (including supply chain professionals and engineers) to find sustainable alternatives for the existing vulnerable processes and procedures and also making efforts in reducing the carbonfoot prints generated by the logistics activities are compensated by the management after recognising their contribution to the environment and to the profitability by the HR concerns of an organizations.

3.1.4 Role of Green HRM in Building Organizational Image

All participants were agreed upon the idea of Green HRM building organizational image. According to the most of the participants green initiatives taken by any functional department create a good image in the mind of the consumer which helps to increase the brand equity of an organization and also it a sustainable image id developed in the industry which helps to attract fresh and competent talent who is keen to give their input for the betterment of the society while generating profit at the same time. However, some of the participants also argued that in Pakistan most of the people are more concerned with welfare work such as charity and least interested towards the environment. So, if an organization is having green HR then in that case it's an essential responsibility of the HR concerns to market those activities through proper communicating the message of green environment irrespective of the department which have taken that green initiative. Only then it will be possible to attract talent from the industry by having a sustainable image. Otherwise, in Pakistan employees are mostly concern with monetary benefits irrespective of their association with any good organization. At this point, some participants argued that mentality of people in Pakistan and all around the world is changing and they inclining towards the sustainability issues; therefore, employees will get attracted from having green association in their professional careers.

3.1.5 Challenges in the Implementation of Green HR in Pakistan

All the participants either their organizations are implementing Green HR policies and practices or not but they all agreed that in Pakistan, the concept of greening in every functional department is vague. One of the biggest challenges is that Pakistan is a developing country and still it has far to go to be called as developed country. Globalization and shift of manufacturing industry from Western Countries to the Eastern countries have increased the scope for manufacturing businesses and simultaneously also increased the competition in the market. Due to these facts it is difficult for the companies to focus on environmental issues as their solution entailed huge initial investment with it, although the investment turn into profitability but in long-term.

4 CONCLUSION

The proposed research is exploring the influence of green HRM policies and practices on the organizational image and profitability by focusing on the FMCG manufacturing companies of Pakistan. The main focused of the study was to explore the green HRM strategies and practices implemented by the FMCG sector of Pakistan and to investigate the awareness regarding the green HRM among the HR professionals of Pakistan. The study indicates that the concept of green HRM among the HR professionals of FMCG companies in Pakistan is vague, HR managers are not aware from the benefits that they can gain in terms of employee retention, satisfaction, productivity and overall organizational profitability by implementing green strategies and establishing an image of sustainable organization in the industry which will ultimately exert positive impact on the brand equity and lead to increased customer base. Consequently, in Pakistan low purchasing power due to various economic indicators, have inclined the employees towards the monetary benefits and they get attracted from the organizations which offer them more benefits irrespective of the sustainable association then can get by working with a sustainable organization. Therefore, according to the HR managers it's not much effective strategy to attract and retain the employees with the help of green initiatives; however, all are agreed upon the need of greening for the betterment of environment specially to minimize the impact of extreme climate and increasing scarcity of resources. Subsequently, it can also be concluded that if an organization strive to implement green strategies by integrating the HR managers and functional managers, then it will not only to the environment but it will also lead the company to save expenses as well.



Additionally, no functional department can implement green solutions or practices unless and until their HR team is not green. This because either an organization strive for green supply chain or for green marketing, for both purposes organization will need green talent from the industry which have sound knowledge to communicate green message and that can only be possible with the help of Green HRM.

5 PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS

In Pakistan, there is an increased scope in the manufacturing industry, ease of entry in the industry and sustainable profits have made the FMCG manufacturing industry attractive for new entrants. But simultaneously this attraction has increased the competition in the industry due to which to sustain in the industry, an organization needs to have a unique competitive advantage which organizations can gain by going green. Green HRM will help the managers to not only promote the efficient use of resources within the organization but by means of green recruiting, HR managers can provide green talent to the functional department such as marketing and supply chain. To implement green supply chain practices which will reduce the cost through continuous innovation of alternative sustainable materials, processes and procedures and marketing which will design green marketing campaigns which will ultimately influence the brand equity of an organization positively. Additionally, green organizational culture might ignite the feeling of environmental sustainability in the employees which later turn into green practices and initiatives.

6 RECOMMENDATION

After conducting in-depth interviews from the HR managers of FMCG manufacturing companies, researcher has observed that managers are least interested in incorporating green practices and initiatives in their conventional HR functions because of the various reasons, as discussed in the study. Also, HR professionals are not aware from the advantages of green HR; therefore, following are some of the recommendations which might help and motivate the organizations to successfully implement green HR policies; Firstly, legislative bodies should enforce environmental laws in Pakistan and strict actions should be taken by the government for distortion of the laws. Secondly, the organizations which believe in the long-term profitability should invest in the green activities as it assures the positive influence on the brand equity and on the fresh talent attraction. Thirdly, the managers should strive to organised awareness campaigns for the employees and market those campaigns through various marketing tactics which will help them attract green talent. Fourthly, integrating with functional managers will help to better find out the solution for the efficient use of resources. Fifthly, compensating the employees for the green initiatives will be the most effective way of motivating the employees to engage in green activities which also influence their organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB).

7 REFERENCES

- [1] Ahmad, S. (2015). Green Human Resource Management: Policies and Practices. Cogent Business & Management, 1-13.
- [2] Ahmad, S. (2015). Green Human Resource Management: Policies and Practices. Cogent Bus. Manag. 2015, 2, 3-17.
- [3] Arulrajah, A., & Opatha, H. (2016). Analytical and theoretical perspectives on green human resource management: a simplified underpinning. Int. Bus. Res. 9 (12), 153-165.
- [4] Bhutto, S. (2016). Effects of Green Human Resources Management on Firm Performance: An Empirical Study on Pakistani firms. European Journal of Business Management, 119-125.
- [5] Birou, L., Green, K., & Inman, R. (2019). Sustainability knowledge and training: outcomes and firm performance. Journal of Manufacturing Technology Management, Vol. 30 Issue: 2, 294-311.
- [6] Bombiak, E., & Kluska, A. (2018). Green Human Resource Management as a Tool for the Sustainable Development of Enterprises: Polish Young Company Experience. Multidisciplinary Digital Publishing Institute, 1-22.
- [7] Burritt, R., & Schaltegger, S. (2018). Business cases and corporate engagement with sustainability: Differentiating Ethical Motivations. Journal of Business Ethics, 241-259.
- [8] Chams, N., & Blandón, J. (2019). On the importance of sustainable human resource management for the adoption of sustainable development goals. Resources, Conservation & Recycling, 109-122.
- [9] Chaudhary, R. (2018). Can green human resource management attract young talent? An empirical analysis. Evidence-based HRM: a Global Forum for Empirical Scholarship, 305-319.
- [10] Cheema, S., & Javed, F. (2017). The effects of corporate social responsibility toward green human resource management: The mediating role of sustainable environment. Cogent Business Management, 905-936.
- [11] Ehnert, I., Parsa, S., Roper, I., Wagner, M., & `Muller-Cammen, M. (2015). Reporting on sustainability and HRM: a comparative study of sustainability reporting practices by the world's largest companies. International Journal of Human Resource Management 27 (1), 88-108.
- [12] Gholami, H., Rezaei, G., Saman, M., Sharif, S., & Zakuan, N. (2016). State of the Art Green HRM system: sustainability in the sports center in Malaysia using a multi methods approach and opportunities for future research. Journal of Cleaner Production 124, 142-163.



- [13] Guerci, M., Luzzini, D., & Longoni, A. (2016). Translating stakeholder pressures into environmental performance: the mediating role of green HRM practices. International Journal of Human Resource Management 27(2), 262-289.
- [14] Haddockmillar, J., Mullercamen, M., & Sanyal, C. (2016). Green human resource management: a comparative qualitative case study of a United States multinational corporation. International Journal of Human Resource Management 27(2), 192-211.
- [15] Haden, S., Olyver, J., & Humphrey, J. (2009). Historical practical, and theoretical perspectives on green management. An Exploratory Analysis Management Decisions, 1041-1055.
- [16] Jabbour, C., & Jabbour, A. (2016). Green Human Resource Management and Green Supply Chain Management: linking two emerging agendas. Journal of Cleaner Production, 1824-1833.
- [17] Kim, A., Kim, Y., Han, K., Jackson, S., & Polyhart, R. (2017). Multilevel influences on voluntary workplace green behavior: Individual differences, leader behavior, and coworker advocacy. Journal of Management, 1335-1358.
- [18] Kim, J. (2018). Corporate Sustainability Management and Its Market Benefits. Sustainability 2018, 10, 1455.
- [19] Kramar, R. (2014). Beyond strategic human resource management: Is sustainable human resource management the next approach? International Journal of Operational Production Management, 1069-1089.
- [20] Longoni, A., Luzzini, D., & Guerci, M. (2018). Deploying Environmental Management Functions: The Relationship Between Green Human Resource Management and Green Supply Chain Management. Journal of Business Ethics, 1081-1095.
- [21] Main Uddin, M., & Islam, R. (2015). Green HRM: Goal Attainment through Environmental Sustainability. The Journal of Nepalese Bussiness Studies, 1-7.
- [22] Mampra, M. (2013). Green HRM: Does it help to build a competitive service sector? Tenth AIMS International Conference on Management, 1273-1281.
- [23] Marhatta, S., & Adhikari, S. (2013). GHRM and sustainability. International eJournal Of Ongoing Research in Management & IT.
- [24] Mathapati, C. (2013). Green HRM: A strategic facet. Management Research Journal, 1-6.
- [25] Nejati, M., Rabiei, S., & Jabbour, C. (2017). Envisioning the invisible: Understanding the synergy between green human resource management and green supply chain management in manufacturing firms in Iran in light of the moderating effect of employees' resistance to change. Journal of Cleaner Production, 163-172.
- [26] Norton, T., Zacher, H., Parker, S., & Ashkanasy, N. (2017). Bridging the gap between green behavioral intentions and employee green behavior: The role of psychological climate. Journal Roganizational Behaviour, 2017, 38, 996-1015.

- [27] Opatha, H., & Arulrajah, A. (2014). Green Human Resource Management: Simplified general reflections. International Business Research, 101-112.
- [28] Priya, A., & Shree, S. (2019). Examining the effect of employee green involvement on perception of corporate social responsibility. Management of Environmental Quality: An International Journal, 197-210.
- [29] Rayner, J., & Morgan, D. (2018). An empirical study of "green" workplace behaviours: Ability, motivation and opportunities. Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resource, 56-78.
- [30] Ren, S., Tang, G., & Jackson, S. (2018). Green human resource management research in emergence: A review and future directions. Asia Pacific Journal of Management, 769-803.
- [31] Roscoe, S., Subramanian, N., Jabbour, C., & Chong, T. (2019). Green human resource management and the enablers of green organisational culture: Enhancing a firm's environmental performance for sustainable development. Business Strategy and the Environment, 50-62.
- [32] Saeed, B., Afsar, B., Hafeez, S., Khan, I., Tahir, M., & (2018).Promoting Afridi, M. employee's proenvironmental behavior through green human resource management practices. Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management.
- [33] Saifulina, N., & Carballo-Penela, A. (2017). Promoting sustainable development at organizational level: An analysis of the drivers of workplace environmentally friendly behaviour of employees. Sustainable Development, 25, 299-310.
- [34] Shah, M. (2019). Green human resource management: Development of a valid measurement scale. Business Strategy and the Environment.
- [35] Shen, J., Dumont, J., & Deng, X. (2017). Employees' perceptions of Green HRM and non-Green employee work outcomes: The social identity and stakeholder perspectives. Group Organizational Management, 26-
- [36] Tang, G., Chen, Y., Jiang, Y., Paille, P., & Jia, J. (2017). Green human resource management practices: scale development and validity. Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources, 1-25.
- [37] Tang, G., Chen, Y., Jiang, Y., Paillé, P., & Jia, J. (2017). Green human resource management practices: scale development and validity. Management of Environmental Quality: An International Journal, 46-57.
- [38] Taylor, P., & Medina, M. N. (2013). Educational Research Paradigms: From Positivism Multiparadigm. Research Gate, 1-17.
- [39] Urbaniak, G. (2017). Colorful Human Resource Management: What Are We Talking About? Human Resource Management, 6-20.
- [40] Zaid, A., Jarron, A., & Bon, A. (2018). The impact of green human resource management and green supply management practices on sustainable



performance: An empirical study. Journal of Cleaner Production, 965-979.

